

Planning for Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries Approach to designing constituencies and regions

Purpose

1. The Commission is invited to consider the approach taken for designing constituencies during the First Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries as it prepares for the Second Review.

Scottish Parliament Boundary Review Rules

2. The rules state the Commission must take into account of:
 - the boundaries of council areas;
 - the electorate of each constituency must be as near the electorate quota as is practicable while having regard to council area boundaries;
 - special geographical considerations; and
 - local ties that may be broken.

Theoretical entitlement

3. During the First Review the Commission considered constituency design by firstly calculating how many constituencies fit within a council area. Where it was not possible to allocate a whole number of constituencies to a council area, council areas were combined.
4. Appendix A shows the theoretical number of constituencies per council area, based on the December 2021 electorate quota.
5. For example this shows that Perth and Kinross council area has a theoretical entitlement for two constituencies. Edinburgh has an entitlement of 6.6 constituencies and would need to be combined with a neighbouring council area such as West Lothian with 2.4 constituencies providing a total entitlement of nine constituencies. One constituency would include parts of Edinburgh and West Lothian council areas.

Council area boundaries and constituencies

6. The rules state the Commission must take into account the boundaries of council areas.
7. There are 73 Scottish Parliament constituencies. The First Review recommended 61 constituencies contained within a single council area (including the preserved constituencies). The other 12 constituencies, included parts of two council areas, and are shown in the table below. No constituencies covered three or more council areas.

Scottish Parliament constituencies covering more than one council area	Council Area 1	Council Area 2
Aberdeen South and North Kincardine	Aberdeenshire	Aberdeen City
Angus North and Mearns	Angus	Aberdeenshire
Banffshire and Buchan	Aberdeenshire	Moray
Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley	South Ayrshire	East Ayrshire
Clackmannanshire and Dunblane	Stirling	Clackmannanshire
Clydebank and Milngavie	West Dunbartonshire	East Dunbartonshire

Dumbarton	West Dunbartonshire	Argyll and Bute
Midlothian North and Musselburgh	Midlothian	East Lothian
Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale	Midlothian	Scottish Borders
Renfrewshire North and West	Renfrewshire	Inverclyde
Renfrewshire South	Renfrewshire	East Renfrewshire
Uddingston and Bellshill	North Lanarkshire	South Lanarkshire

8. During the First Review the Commission designed constituencies based on a variety of boundaries such as existing ward boundaries and natural features. 42 wards were split between constituencies.
9. The Commission recommended constituencies with a wide range of electorate during the First Review. It recommended a Renfrewshire North and West constituency with 48,520 electors that split three wards and a Linlithgow constituency with 62,810 electors that split a single ward. The electorate quota for the First Review was 54,728 electors per constituency.
10. Unlike the legislation that governs the design of UK Parliament constituencies there is no maximum area rule for Scottish Parliament constituencies.

Council area boundaries and regions

11. There are eight Scottish Parliament regions. Each region returns seven Regional MSP's.
- five regions contain nine constituencies;
 - Highlands and Islands region contains eight constituencies; and
 - two regions (West Scotland and North East Scotland) contain 10 constituencies.
12. 27 council areas are each contained within a single region, this includes the preserved constituencies. Four council areas are each divided between two regions, and one is divided between three regions.

Council areas covering more than one region			
Council Area	Region 1	Region 2	Region 3
Moray	Highlands and Islands	North East Scotland	
Argyll and Bute	Highlands and Islands	West Scotland	
East Lothian	Lothian	South Scotland	
Midlothian	Lothian	South Scotland	
South Lanarkshire	Central Scotland	South Scotland	Glasgow

13. All regions with their council area make-up are shown in the table below.

Region	Council Area
Lothian	City of Edinburgh, East Lothian (part), Midlothian (part), West Lothian
Glasgow	Glasgow City, South Lanarkshire (part)
Highlands and Islands	Highland, Moray (part), Argyll and Bute (part),

	Orkney Islands, Shetland Islands, Na h-Eileanan an Iar
South Scotland	Midlothian (part), East Lothian (part), Scottish Borders, South Lanarkshire (part), Dumfries and Galloway, East Ayrshire, South Ayrshire
West Scotland	Argyll and Bute (part), North Ayrshire, East Renfrewshire, Renfrewshire, East Dunbartonshire, West Dunbartonshire, Inverclyde
Central Scotland	Falkirk, North Lanarkshire, South Lanarkshire (part)
North East Scotland	Angus, Dundee City, Aberdeenshire, Aberdeen City, Moray (part)
Mid Scotland and Fife	Fife, Clackmannanshire, Stirling, Perth and Kinross

14. Paper 13 provides maps of the Scottish Parliament regions and constituencies.

Regions – entitlement

15. The first regional rule requires that each constituency is contained within a single region.

16. During the First Review, the Commission focussed on designing constituencies first, before it considered regions. The Commission's Process and Design Methodology offered no explanation as to how regions were considered but its Descriptive Booklet for the First Review stated it "will make provisional proposals for the regions taking into account its deliberations on provisional proposals and any revised recommendations for constituencies."

17. The Commission could follow the same approach for the Second Review or retain the existing region boundaries or design regions first, based on a regional entitlement, similar to constituency entitlement.

18. The Secretariat have developed a draft option to show how region entitlement could work and how it could avoid splitting council areas between regions, see Appendix B.

Conclusion

19. The Commission is invited to note and make any comments on this paper as it prepares for the Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries.

Secretariat, July 2022

Theoretical entitlement of constituencies per council area

Council area	Electorate (Dec 2021)	Constituency theoretical entitlement
Aberdeen City	168,191	2.8
Aberdeenshire	205,775	3.4
Angus	91,416	1.5
Argyll and Bute	70,247	1.2
City of Edinburgh	397,692	6.6
Clackmannanshire	40,228	0.7
Dumfries and Galloway	116,713	2.0
Dundee City	112,050	1.9
East Ayrshire	97,920	1.6
East Dunbartonshire	88,870	1.5
East Lothian	87,919	1.5
East Renfrewshire	73,583	1.2
Falkirk	125,525	2.1
Fife	286,126	4.8
Glasgow City	465,164	7.8
Highland	187,428	3.1
Inverclyde	60,632	1.0
Midlothian	75,401	1.3
Moray	74,641	1.2
North Ayrshire	110,043	1.8
North Lanarkshire	262,926	4.4
Perth and Kinross	119,961	2.0
Renfrewshire	141,027	2.4
Scottish Borders	93,067	1.6
South Ayrshire	92,888	1.6
South Lanarkshire	255,924	4.3
Stirling	70,977	1.2
West Dunbartonshire	70,219	1.2
West Lothian	145,310	2.4
<i>Na h-Eileanan an Iar</i>	<i>21,626</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Orkney Islands</i>	<i>17,669</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Shetland Islands</i>	<i>18,059</i>	<i>1</i>
		73

Draft region entitlement

Appendix B

Regions (council area)	Electorate (Dec. 2021)	Theoretical Entitlement	Rounded Entitlement	% difference from region quota (530,652)
Highland	187,428	3.1		
Argyll and Bute	70,247	1.2		
Moray	74,641	1.2		
Na h-Eileanan an Iar	21,626	1.0		
Shetland Islands	18,059	1.0		
Orkney Islands	17,669	1.0		
	389,670	8.6	8	-26.6%
Aberdeen City	168,191	2.8		
Aberdeenshire	205,775	3.4		
Angus	91,416	1.5		
Dundee City	112,050	1.9		
	577,432	9.7	10	8.8%
Clackmannanshire	40,228	0.7		
Fife	286,126	4.8		
Perth and Kinross	119,961	2.0		
Stirling	70,977	1.2		
	517,292	8.6	9	-2.5%
West Dunbartonshire	70,219	1.2		
East Dunbartonshire	88,870	1.5		
North Lanarkshire	262,926	4.4		
Falkirk	125,525	2.1		
	547,540	9.2	9	3.1%
West Lothian	145,310	2.4		
City of Edinburgh	397,692	6.6		
	543,002	9.1	9	2.3%
East Lothian	87,919	1.5		
Midlothian	75,401	1.3		
Scottish Borders	93,067	1.6		
South Lanarkshire	255,924	4.3		
	512,311	8.6	9	-3.5%
Dumfries and Galloway	116,713	2.0		
East Ayrshire	97,920	1.6		
North Ayrshire	110,043	1.8		
South Ayrshire	92,888	1.6		
Inverclyde	60,632	1.0		
Renfrewshire	141,027	2.4		
	619,223	10.4	10	16.7
Glasgow City	465,164	7.8		
East Renfrewshire	73,583	1.2		
	538,747	9.0	9	1.5%