

Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries Provisional Proposals for Region Names

Action required

1. The Commission is invited to confirm its Provisional Proposals for region names.

Background

2. At its meeting of 23 July 2024 the Commission considered its Provisional Proposals for regions (Paper BS 118), subject to the Falkirk local inquiry held on 22 August 2024. The Commission preferred Option 3 but wished to consider if an Edinburgh and East Lothian Council area region was feasible.
3. The Secretariat developed three further options: 3A, 3B and 3C which were shared after the meeting for consideration.
4. The Commission preferred Option 3C because: it did not split a council area (West Lothian) between three regions as proposed in Option 3A; it offered acceptable electoral parity (Option 3B proposed a South Scotland region with electoral parity of 13.9%); avoided a South Scotland region which included Bathgate as proposed in Option 3B; and it included East Lothian in its entirety, bringing together communities that had been split in constituency designs.
5. The proposed Central Scotland region includes Falkirk, West Lothian, North Lanarkshire and part of South Lanarkshire Council areas and any of the suggestions for alternative constituency boundaries discussed in Paper BS 126 (Draft Revised Proposals/ Final Recommendations for Constituencies - Argyll and Bute, East Dunbartonshire, Falkirk, North Lanarkshire, South Lanarkshire, West Dunbartonshire and West Lothian Council areas) will not affect the proposed Central Scotland region boundary.

Option 3C

6. The Commission are reminded of their Provisional Proposals for regions which propose:
 - to retain the existing Mid Scotland and Fife region;
 - a minor change to the existing Highlands and Islands; and North East Scotland region boundaries. They now follow a new constituency boundary. The constituency boundary aligns with a Moray ward boundary by Arradoul;
 - to consider special geographical circumstances in Highlands and Islands region due to it containing islands and remote areas which are difficult to access;
 - a Glasgow region boundary similar to the existing boundary except by Renfrew, it now includes an Erskine, Renfrew and Cardonald constituency;
 - an Edinburgh region whose boundary includes the whole of East Lothian and Edinburgh Council areas as well as part of Midlothian Council area;
 - a West Scotland region boundary similar to the existing boundary except by Stewarton and Renfrew, Erskine and Bishopton;
 - a South Scotland region boundary similar to the existing boundary except by East Lothian; East Kilbride/ Hamilton; and Stewarton; and
 - a Central Scotland region boundary which includes all constituencies within Falkirk, North Lanarkshire and West Lothian Council areas. It also includes Bothwell in South Lanarkshire Council area.

7. A map of Option 3C can be found at Appendix A. The constituencies within each region are shown below. The constituency names within the proposed Central Scotland region are still to be agreed.

Region	Constituencies	Electorate
Central Scotland	<i>Constituency names from the revised proposals are shown below for Central Scotland as constituency boundaries and names for further proposals are still to be agreed, see Paper BS 126.</i> Bathgate; Livingston and Breich Valley; Airdrie; Linlithgow and Falkirk South; Coatbridge and Chryston; Cumbernauld and Kilsyth; Falkirk North; Motherwell and Wishaw; Uddingston and Bellshill.	550,720
Edinburgh	East Lothian Coast and Lammermuirs; Edinburgh Central; Edinburgh Eastern, Musselburgh and Tranent; Edinburgh North Eastern and Leith; Edinburgh North Western; Edinburgh Northern; Edinburgh South Western; Edinburgh Southern; Midlothian North	543,001
Glasgow	Erskine, Renfrew and Cardonald; Glasgow Anniesland; Glasgow Baillieston and Shettleston; Glasgow Cathcart and Pollok; Glasgow Central; Glasgow Easterhouse and Springburn; Glasgow Kelvin and Maryhill; Glasgow Southside; Rutherglen	563,298
Highlands and Islands	Argyll and Bute; Caithness, Sutherland and Ross; Inverness and Nairn; Moray; Na h-Eileanan an Iar; Orkney Islands; Shetland Islands; Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch	359,306
Mid Scotland and Fife	Clackmannanshire and Dunblane; Cowdenbeath; Dunfermline; Fife North East; Kirkcaldy; Mid Fife and Glenrothes; Perthshire North; Perthshire South and Kinross-shire; Stirling	521,460
North East Scotland	Aberdeen Central; Aberdeen Donside; Aberdeen Deeside and North Kincardine; Aberdeenshire East; Aberdeenshire West; Angus North and Mearns; Angus South; Banffshire and Buchan Coast; Dundee City East; Dundee City West	589,084
South Scotland	Ayr; Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley; Clydesdale; Dumfriesshire; East Kilbride; Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire; Galloway and West Dumfries; Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse; Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley; Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale	594,925
West Scotland	Clydebank and Milngavie; Cunninghame North; Cunninghame South; Dumbarton; Eastwood; Inverclyde; Paisley; Renfrewshire West; Strathkelvin and Bearsden	528,772

Region Names

8. The original Scottish Parliament regions were based on European constituency boundaries and names in use at that time.
9. The First Review recommended minor changes to the names of three regions: Lothians was amended to Lothian; South of Scotland to South Scotland; and West of Scotland to West Scotland.
10. When developing proposals for constituencies the Commission considered the Boundary Commission for Scotland's (BCS) 2023 Review Policies and Procedures booklet on naming constituencies. An extract from this is below. For consideration of region names the Commission may also wish to reflect on using existing names where a successor is recognisably similar and shorter names.
11. BCS 2023 Review Policies and Procedures booklet stated "As part of a review, we recommend a name for each constituency, and have developed a set of guidelines when proposing names for constituencies:
 - to use an existing constituency name where there is a successor constituency that is recognisably similar;
 - to prefer constituency names that are short rather than attempt to describe an area exhaustively;
 - to ensure that names of UK Parliament constituencies in general differ from those of Scottish Parliament constituencies where an appropriate and distinct alternative is available. Relying on word order alone (e.g. 'Glasgow East' and 'East Glasgow') or conjunctions (eg 'North and East Fife) is generally not a sufficient difference;
 - not to place compass points at the beginning of a name, in order to help make an alphabetically sorted list easier to use. We make an exception if a constituency is named after a council area or town which has a compass point at the start of its name (such as East Lothian or East Kilbride); and
 - to use 'South West' rather than 'Southwest.'"
12. The naming convention of regions places compass points at the start of names. Since the number of regions is small this does not present the same difficulty with alphabetical ordering than it would with constituency names.
13. The Commission may wish to:
 - retain the existing Mid Scotland and Fife region name because its boundary is unchanged;
 - retain the existing Highlands and Islands and North East Scotland region names because there is only a minor change to their boundaries;
 - consider whether to change the name of the Glasgow region. The proposed boundary is extended westwards to include Renfrew, Erskine and Bishopton. The existing Glasgow region includes the whole of Glasgow City Council area and a Rutherglen constituency from South Lanarkshire. Glasgow City Council area boundary does not have many strong bounding features and some from Renfrewshire or Rutherglen may identify as being part of Glasgow.

- consider whether to change the name of the South Scotland region. The existing South Scotland region boundary is amended by East Lothian; East Kilbride/ Hamilton; and Stewarton. The region covers the lower part of the country, an alternative name could be Lower Scotland or Lowland Scotland. There is no obvious alternative name for south. Any other name would be lengthy to describe, such as South Ayrshire, Dumfriesshire, Borders, Lanarkshire and Dunbartonshire.
- consider whether to change the name of the Central Scotland region. Although it differs from the existing Central region boundary by West Lothian and East Kilbride/ Hamilton it covers an area of the Central belt between Edinburgh and Glasgow. It includes all constituencies within Falkirk, North Lanarkshire and West Lothian Council areas as well as Bothwell in South Lanarkshire Council area. An alternative such as Middle or Mid Scotland has already been used as a region name.
- consider whether to change the name of the proposed Edinburgh region. The existing Lothian region includes the whole of City of Edinburgh and West Lothian Council areas and the Midlothian North and Musselburgh constituency (partly East Lothian and Midlothian Council areas). The existing Lothian region includes 100% of the electorate of City of Edinburgh and West Lothian Council areas and 24% of the electorate of East Lothian Council area and 65% of the electorate of Midlothian Council area. The Provisional Proposals include the whole of Edinburgh and East Lothian Council areas, part of Midlothian Council area and none of West Lothian Council area. (100% electorate of Edinburgh and East Lothian Council areas, 71% of Midlothian Council area and 0% of West Lothian Council area). An alternative name could be Edinburgh and East Lothian or to retain the existing region name - Lothian. The electorates of the Edinburgh and Lothian Council areas are: Edinburgh - 400,466; East Lothian - 88,539; Midlothian -76,131; West Lothian 146,456.
- consider whether to change the name of the West Scotland region. The existing boundary is amended by Stewarton as well as Renfrew, Erskine and Bishopton. Any alternative name would be lengthy to describe, such as North Ayrshire, Renfrewshire, Dunbartonshire and Lomond.

14. Other historical or existing boundaries used in the Lothian and Glasgow areas include:

- a Lothian Region (local government area boundary between 1974 and 1996) mainly included the whole of the existing Edinburgh, East Lothian, Midlothian and West Lothian Council areas. The Strathclyde region included: Glasgow, Ayrshire, Lanarkshire, Renfrewshire, Dunbartonshire and Argyll and Bute.
- in healthcare the Greater Glasgow Health Board includes: Glasgow, East/West Dunbartonshire, Inverclyde, East Renfrewshire and Renfrewshire council areas. Lothian Health Board includes: East Lothian, Edinburgh, Midlothian and West Lothian Council areas.
- In the judiciary, there are six Sheriffdoms. The Lothian and Borders Sheriffdom includes East Lothian, Edinburgh, Midlothian, Scottish Borders and West Lothian Council areas. The Glasgow and Strathkelvin Sheriffdom includes most of Glasgow and East Dunbartonshire Council areas.

Local Inquiry

15. The Commission is required to hold a local inquiry on its proposals for regions if a local authority objects (that is a local authority for part or all of the area of the proposed region) or a body of 500 or more electors for the proposed region.
16. During the First Review, consultation on Provisional Proposals for regions, one local inquiry was held in Glasgow. Over 200 comments were submitted during the consultation. Most comments opposed the inclusion of a Clydebank and Milngavie constituency in an East Central Scotland region. There was also opposition to a Linlithgow constituency within an East Central Scotland region and a Dumbarton consistency within the proposed Highlands and Islands region. Three councils objected to the Provisional Proposals for regions: Highland; West Dunbartonshire; and West Lothian. The Assistant Commissioners report from the local inquiry recommended: the Highlands and Islands region should not include a Dumbarton constituency; the West of Scotland region should include a Clydebank and Milngavie constituency; and a Lothian region should include Linlithgow but not East Lothian. There were 13 responses to the second round of consultation on regions.

Summary

17. Following its meeting of 23 July 2024 the Commission agreed its Provisional Proposals for regions, subject to the Falkirk local inquiry.
18. The Commission may wish to retain the existing region names if they are recognisably similar.
19. Some alternative region names are provided for consideration but the Commission may prefer shorter names.

Conclusion

20. The Commission is invited to agree its Provisional Proposals for regions names for public consultation.

Secretariat
September 2024

