

**Minutes of Meeting held in person at Thistle House and by videolink  
10:00am on Wednesday 5 April 2023**

**Present**

Mr R Hinds, Chair  
Prof. A Henderson, Deputy Chair  
Mr R Bean  
Mr J Collins  
Mr G Macmillan  
Dr S Walker

Ms I Drummond-Murray, Secretary  
Mr C Wilson  
Mr D Campbell  
Mr P Allan

The Chair welcomed Pat Allan who had recently joined the Secretariat to the meeting.

**Apologies**

1. None

**Declaration of Interests**

2. All of the Commissioners declared an interest in Paper 52 Provisional Proposals - Constituency names and designations.

**Minutes of previous meeting**

3. The Commission agreed the minutes of the meeting of 9 March 2023 without amendment.

**Matters arising**

4. The Secretary advised that the Boundary Commission for Scotland (BCS) had agreed its 2023 Review Final Recommendations for UK Parliament constituencies. The Secretariat are currently drafting the final report for submission in late June 2023. The names of the recommended UK Parliament constituencies would be shared confidentially when the Commission discussed Paper 52.
5. The Secretary informed the Commission that Prof Henderson had been successful with her application for Chair of Boundaries Scotland. Her appointment will commence from 1 June 2023. The Secretary also informed the Commission that candidates for the two Commissioner posts had been shortlisted but the candidates were still to be formally offered positions.

**Business update**

6. The Secretary informed the Commission that the Chair, Secretary and Mr Allan had attended a meeting at the Scottish Parliament with MSPs, Political Researchers and Parliamentary staff on 29 March 2023. The Chair and Secretary reported that those in attendance had shown a keen interest in the Second Review of Scottish Parliament Constituencies.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Scottish Borders and South Lanarkshire Council areas (Paper BS 47)**

7. At its March meeting the Commission had discussed Paper BS 40 and the three options presented for Scottish Borders and South Lanarkshire Council areas. The Commission had preferred Option 2 from Paper BS 40 as it offered an improvement on the existing variation from the electoral quota and maintained local ties by splitting no wards but had asked the Secretariat to consider following the existing constituency boundary by Blantyre.
8. The Commission considered the two options in Paper 47 and preferred Option 2A because it avoided a bottle neck shape Hamilton constituency by Blantyre and it followed the existing constituency boundary.
9. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 2A as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to the changes outlined above and satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Argyll and Bute, East Dunbartonshire, North Lanarkshire and West Dunbartonshire Council areas (Paper BS 48)**

10. At its March meeting the Commission had discussed Paper BS 42 and the four options presented for Argyll and Bute, East Dunbartonshire, North Lanarkshire and West Dunbartonshire Council areas. The Commission had preferred Option 4 from Paper BS 42 as it split fewer towns, better reflected local ties, and offered better variation from electoral quota in comparison with the other options. The Commission had asked that an option be brought to the next meeting that aimed to improve variation from the electoral quota between the proposed Bearsden constituency and Dumbarton and Helensburgh constituency while considering local ties in Clydebank.
11. The Commission noted that Option 4 and Option 5 in Paper 48 may both break local ties in Clydebank, but they preferred Option 5 because it improved variation from the electoral quota.
12. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 5 as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to the changes outlined above and satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for East Renfrewshire, Glasgow City, Inverclyde and Renfrewshire Council areas (Paper BS 49)**

13. At its March meeting the Commission had discussed Paper BS 41 and the four options presented for Glasgow City, East Renfrewshire, Inverclyde and Renfrewshire Council areas. The Commission agreed Option 2B from Paper BS 41 had offered the best variation from electoral quota in comparison with the other options but acknowledged the challenges of designing constituencies in this grouping given the higher average electorate and the desire to maintain the integrity of council area boundaries as per the legislation. The Commission had asked that an option be brought to the April meeting that aimed for each constituency in the grouping to be within 10% variation from electoral quota. The Commission also asked for an option that linked this council area grouping with a neighbouring council area grouping to see if variation from electoral quota can be improved whilst also considering local ties.

14. The Commission considered the four options presented in Paper BS 49.
15. The Commission noted Option 2B had proposed four constituencies with variation from the electorate quota over 10%. The Commission believed that Option 5 would break local ties in Gourock and in Ayrshire where the Commission had proposed minimal change to the existing constituency boundaries.
16. The Commission then considered Option 2B1 and Option 4. Option 2B1 considered the Glasgow City Council area boundary and had proposed seven constituencies within Glasgow but it split 19 existing wards which may break local ties in those areas. Option 4 offered improved variation from the electorate quota but it proposed a constituency that included parts of Glasgow and Renfrewshire. The Commission discussed the strength of the Glasgow City Council area boundary and lack of physical features demarcating its boundary.
17. The Commission preferred Option 4 because it offered improved variation from the electorate quota, split fewer wards and considered the Inverclyde Council area boundary.
18. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 4 as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to the changes outlined above and satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

#### **Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Highland Council area (Paper BS 50)**

19. At its March 2023 meeting the Commission had considered Paper BS 37 (Draft Provisional Proposals for Highland Council area) but asked the Secretariat to refine the boundaries in Option 1A in Speyside by Carrbridge to follow the A9 and A85 roads which would offer an easily recognisable boundary. The Commission also asked the Secretariat to investigate if there was any merit in placing the Black Isle ward in a Caithness, Sutherland and Ross constituency.
20. The Commission considered the three options presented in Paper 50.
21. The Commission noted that adding the Black Isle to a Caithness, Sutherland and Ross constituency would create a constituency of two parts – the Black Isle would be separate from Easter Ross, Caithness and Sutherland, worsen variation from electoral parity in a remote constituency and increase the area of an already large constituency with poor transport links.
22. The Commission preferred Option 1A (Revised) because it followed recognized boundaries the A9 and A85 roads.
23. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 1A (Revised) as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to the changes outlined above and satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

#### **Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Angus and Moray Council areas (Paper BS 51)**

24. At its March meeting the Commission had considered Paper BS 38 (Draft Provisional Proposals for Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Angus and Moray Council areas) but asked the Secretariat to refine the boundaries in Option 1A by Maud and Mintlaw in Aberdeenshire to follow the A950 road.
25. The Commission considered the two options presented in Paper 51.
26. The Commission noted that although Option 1A (Revised) followed the A950 road, creating an easily identifiable boundary, it split Mintlaw between constituencies. The Commission agreed that if the boundary followed a community council area boundary north of Mintlaw it would avoid dividing Mintlaw and better reflect local ties in the area.
27. The Commission agreed to adopt without amendment option 1A (Revised) as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to the changes outlined above and satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

#### **Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals Constituency Names (Paper BS 52)**

28. The Commission discussed Paper BS 52 and agreed the list of Constituency names attached at Appendix A. Constituency names for East Renfrewshire, Glasgow City, Inverclyde and Renfrewshire Council areas were to be agreed by email.

#### **Finance update (oral update)**

29. A brief oral finance update was noted.

#### **Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries (oral update)**

30. The Commission noted draft publicity materials and were asked to provide any comments or feedback on them by email.

#### **Future meetings (oral)**

31. The Commission will next meet on 23 May 2023.

#### **Any other business**

32. There was no other business.

**Appendix A****Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Agreed Provisional Proposals Constituency Names****Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Angus and Moray Council areas**

- Aberdeen Central
- Aberdeen Donside
- Aberdeen South and North Kincardine
- Aberdeenshire East
- Aberdeenshire West
- Angus North and Mearns
- Angus South
- Banff and Buchan Coast
- Moray

**Argyll and Bute, West Dunbartonshire, East Dunbartonshire and North Lanarkshire Council areas**

- Airdrie, Newmains and Shotts
- Argyll and Bute
- Bearsden, Milngavie and Clydebank North
- Bellshill and Coatbridge
- Cumbernauld and Chryston
- Dumbarton and Helensburgh
- Kirkintilloch and Kilsyth
- Motherwell

**City of Edinburgh, East Lothian, Midlothian and West Lothian Council areas**

- Edinburgh Central
- Edinburgh Eastern
- Edinburgh Northern and Leith
- Edinburgh Pentlands
- Edinburgh Southern
- Edinburgh Western
- Edinburgh Forth and Linlithgow
- Bathgate and Almond Valley
- East Lothian
- Livingston
- Midlothian North and Musselburgh
- Midlothian South

**Clackmannanshire, Falkirk and Stirling Council areas**

- Falkirk East
- Falkirk West
- Clackmannanshire and Dunblane
- Stirling

**Dumfries and Galloway Council area**

- Dumfriesshire
- Galloway and West Dumfries

**Dundee City Council area**

- Dundee City East
- Dundee City West

**East Ayrshire, North Ayrshire, South Ayrshire Council areas**

- Ayr
- Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley
- Cunninghame North
- Cunninghame South
- Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley

**Fife Council area**

- Fife North East
- Mid Fife and Glenrothes
- Kirkcaldy
- Cowdenbeath
- Dunfermline

**Glasgow City, Inverclyde, Renfrewshire, East Renfrewshire Council areas**

- Glasgow Anniesland
- Glasgow Cardonald and Pollok
- Glasgow Central and Govan
- Glasgow Kelvin and Maryhill
- Glasgow Priesthill and Giffnock
- Glasgow Shettleston and Baillieston
- Glasgow Southside and Cathcart
- Glasgow Springburn and Provan

**Highland Council area**

- Caithness, Sutherland and Ross
- Inverness and Nairn
- Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch

**Perth and Kinross Council area**

- Perthshire North
- Perthshire South and Kinross-shire

**South Lanarkshire/ Scottish Borders**

- Etrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire
- East Kilbride
- Rutherglen
- Hamilton and Uddingston
- Larkhall and Clydesdale
- Clyde Valley and Tweeddale