

**Minutes of Meeting held in person and by videolink at  
10:00am on Wednesday 14 December 2022**

**Present**

Mr R Hinds, Chair  
Prof. A Henderson, Deputy Chair  
Mr R Bean  
Mr J Collins  
Mr G Macmillan  
Dr S Walker

Ms I Drummond-Murray, Secretary  
Mr C Wilson  
Mr D Campbell  
Mrs Y Croll

**Declaration of Interests**

1. Mr Macmillan and Mr Bean declared an interest in item 11 of the agenda, Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Perth and Kinross Council area (Paper BS 26) as both reside within Perth and Kinross Council area.

**Minutes of previous meeting**

2. The Commission agreed the minutes of the meeting of 6 October 2022 without amendment.

**Matters arising**

3. The Secretary reported that an advert had been placed to replace a member of the Secretariat with a closing date of 15 December 2022.
4. The Commission noted that Scottish Government had placed an advert on its website for a new Chair and Commissioner(s). Applications close on 19 December 2022. The Chair reported that he had attended a Scottish Government event to encourage a wider range of applicants to apply for public appointments.

**Business update**

5. The Commission were informed that the Boundary Commission for Scotland (BCS) had just concluded the final consultation stage of its 2023 Review of UK Parliament Constituencies. Approx 850 responses had been submitted. BCS will share any analysis of the consultation with the Commission. BCS will develop its Final Recommendations and submit a report to Parliament in late June 2023.

**UK Commissions meeting (oral update)**

6. The Commission were given an update by the Secretary, Deputy Chair and Mr Collins on the matters discussed at the UK Commissions meeting, held in Cardiff on 24 and 25 November 2022.
7. It was agreed that the next UK Commissions meeting will take place in Edinburgh in 2023 and will be jointly hosted by the Boundary Commission for Scotland and Boundaries Scotland.
8. The Commission asked the Secretary to seek an update from the Local Government Boundary Commission for England regarding their work on customer satisfaction and council size.

**Electoral reform update (oral update)**

9. The Secretary updated the Commission that the Electoral Reform consultation was launched on 14 December 2022 for a period of 13 weeks. A response to the consultation will be drafted by the Secretariat for consideration at a future meeting. The consultation can be viewed online:  
<https://consult.gov.scot/constitution-and-cabinet/electoral-reform/>

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries (oral update)**

10. The Chair and Deputy Chair informed the Commission of their meeting with the SPPA Committee on 3 November 2022. The Commission asked the Secretariat to contact the Chief Executive of the Scottish Parliament and clerk of the SPPA Committee in order to progress plans for MSP engagement in early 2023.
11. The Chair informed the Commission of his meeting with the Chair of the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives (SOLACE).
12. The Commission noted the updated project plan, in Gantt Chart format, for the Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Guidance Booklet (Paper BS 23)**

13. The Commission discussed Paper BS 23, and suggested various edits to the guidance booklet.
14. The Commission asked the Secretariat to create a short form document that summarises the Second Review. They suggested asking a copywriter to assist with simplifying the content and language of the summary document and the booklet.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Constituency Design Approach (Paper BS 24)**

15. The Commission considered Paper BS 24 and discussed its approach for designing constituencies and regions for the Second Review of Scottish Parliament boundaries.
16. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituency design approach in Option 1 as its general approach for the Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries. The Commission advised they were flexible with the proposed council area groupings from Option 1 and would amend the groupings, if it improved constituency design when developing its provisional proposals and later when it may develop revised proposals. The Commission suggested that consideration could be given to following the local government region boundaries in use from 1974-1996 in some areas as these were historically familiar.
17. The Commission asked the Secretariat to share any relevant information on local ties being broken from the recent BCS 2023 Review consultation.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Dumfries and Galloway Council area (Paper BS 25)**

18. The Commission discussed Paper BS 25, and the two options presented for Dumfries and Galloway Council area.

19. The Commission preferred Option 1 because it minimised change by retaining the existing constituency boundaries.
20. The Commission noted that while Option 2 improved variation from electoral parity, it linked areas as diverse as Annandale and Galloway (Stranraer) .
21. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 1 as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Perth and Kinross Council area (Paper BS 26)**

22. The Commission discussed Paper BS 26 and the three options presented for Perth and Kinross Council area
23. The Commission preferred Option 1A because it minimised change while mainly retaining the existing constituency boundaries and proposed recognised boundaries (existing ward and a railway line). Option 1A also offered less variation from the electoral quota compared to Option 1 and Option 2.
24. The Commission felt Option 2 would break long standing connections between Crieff and Perth.
25. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 1A as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Dundee City Council area (Paper BS 27)**

26. The Commission discussed Paper BS 27. and the two options presented for Dundee City Council area.
27. The Commission preferred Option 1 because it minimised change by retaining existing constituency boundaries as well as offering less variation from the electoral quota compared to Option 2.
28. The Commission also felt the boundaries in Option 1 currently follow roads where they do not follow ward boundaries which may be more easily recognised by the local electorate.
29. The Commission provisionally agreed to adopt the constituencies in Option 1 as its Provisional Proposals for public consultation, subject to satisfactory constituencies being designed in other groupings.

**Second Review of Scottish Parliament Boundaries – Draft Provisional Proposals for Fife Council area (Paper BS 28)**

30. The Commission discussed Paper BS 28 and the three options presented for Fife Council area.
31. The Commission agreed that Option 1 and Option 2 were acceptable arrangements but prior to agreeing either they asked the Secretariat to refine the boundaries in option 2 in a way that recognised Rule 3 of the legislation, by Burntisland and Lochgelly.

32. The Commission noted that Option 3 offered high variation from the electoral quota in the proposed Glenrothes constituency and asked the Secretariat to analysis recent electorate trends within the Mid Fife and Glenrothes constituency.

33. The Commission asked the Secretariat to bring a paper with a revised Option 2 to the next Commission for consideration.

**Finance update (Paper BS 29)**

34. The Commission noted the finance update and asked the Secretariat to include Assistant Commissioner fees for possible Local Inquiries to the budget.

**Future meetings (oral)**

35. The Secretariat were asked to canvass for dates in January, February and March 2023 for two meetings.

**Any other business**

36. There was no other business.